

Message

From: Bahadori, Tina [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=7DA7967DCAFB4C5BBC39C666FEE31EC3-BAHADORI, TINA]
Sent: 5/18/2016 10:51:00 PM
To: Deener, Kathleen [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=b9a2ff1c086249ea8f6414afde8a5e54-Deener, Kathleen]; Cogliano, Vincent [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=51f2736376ac4d32bad2fe7cfef2886b-Cogliano, Vincent]
CC: Burke, Thomas [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=39ffc3dd34ea495b9a31e61b778fbbec-Burke, Thom]; Kavlock, Robert [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=eebac67f01094409a7fdaa955a837884-Kavlock, Robert]; Hauchman, Fred [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=f8bf9785f32048ccad5f60b25a72017d-Hauchman, Fred]; Gwinn, Maureen [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=4bdc5237a5c440a7b664518e23eb5647-Gwinn, Maureen]; Corona, Elizabeth [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=18d86fb8269b4557b5d06622b3a941af-Corona, Elizabeth]; Blackburn, Elizabeth [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=a080eb90549a453aaa6a357f5257c0b7-Blackburn, Elizabeth]; Vandenberg, John [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=dcae2b98a04540fb8d099f9d4dead690-Vandenberg, John]; Flowers, Lynn [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=1a4411c874d041b9a8badfc32b91bd70-Flowers, Lynn]; Fegley, Robert [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=790aa5a70d9045bda631d9d6e548d704-Fegley, Robert]
Subject: RE: UN Agencies: Glyphosate 'Unlikely' to Cause Cancer (BNA Report)

I don't have any experience with ILSI/HESI directly, but it was my understanding that funds that go to ILSI/HESI do not benefit committee or Board members, they benefit ILSI/HESI and its staff. But if this understanding is incorrect or can be *perceived* to be incorrect, perhaps we should evaluate the extensive engagement ORD has with this organization?

I am in an EFSA/RIVM meeting this week in which Boobis is also participating. His general dispositions on most issues is that of a 'classical' toxicologist operating in the universe of pesticide RAs and regulatory management. Like most senior (and ordained) European scientists, he is recalcitrant and fairly steadfast in his opinions -- and in general not very amenable to 'influence.' He repeatedly declared glyphosate to be "a benign molecule." And, it took quite a bit of self-control from him not to audibly growl when I mentioned the EPA-sponsored NAS low-dose study. He suggested that such concerns would paralyze the path forward for developing approaches for cumulative risk assessments of pesticides....which is something he has apparently been tasked to lead.

Tina

From: Deener, Kathleen
Sent: Wednesday, May 18, 2016 4:01 PM
To: Cogliano, Vincent <cogliano.vincent@epa.gov>
Cc: Burke, Thomas <Burke.Thomas@epa.gov>; Kavlock, Robert <Kavlock.Robert@epa.gov>; Hauchman, Fred <hauchman.fred@epa.gov>; Bahadori, Tina <Bahadori.Tina@epa.gov>; Gwinn, Maureen <gwinn.maureen@epa.gov>; Corona, Elizabeth <Corona.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Blackburn, Elizabeth <Blackburn.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Vandenberg, John <Vandenberg.John@epa.gov>; Flowers, Lynn <Flowers.Lynn@epa.gov>; Fegley, Robert <Fegley.Robert@epa.gov>; Perovich, Gina <Perovich.Gina@epa.gov>; Jones, Samantha <Jones.Samantha@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: UN Agencies: Glyphosate 'Unlikely' to Cause Cancer (BNA Report)

Thanks Vince. I hadn't seen that. I'm pasting a related Greenwire story here for anyone who is interested:

Leaders of panel that backed glyphosate took Monsanto funding

Published: Wednesday, May 18, 2016

The United Nations panel that recently found glyphosate was not likely to be a human carcinogen has since been roiled by conflict-of-interest allegations.

Alan Boobis, the chairman of the United Nations' joint Food and Agriculture Organization/World Health Organization meeting on glyphosate, also serves at the vice president of the International Life Sciences Institute Europe. Its co-chairman was Angelo Moretto, a board member of ILSI's Health and Environmental Sciences Institute.

According to documents posted by the group U.S. Right to Know, the institute accepted a \$500,000 donation from Monsanto Co., which manufactures glyphosate, in 2012. The group also received \$528,500 from CropLife International.

Boobis said his objectivity was not compromised by the funding.

"My role in ILSI (and two of its branches) is as a public-sector member and chair of their boards of trustees, positions which are not remunerated," Boobis said. "The boards of trustees are responsible for oversight of the organizations and their scientific programs."

Environmental groups condemned the finding.

"There is a clear conflict of interest here if the review of the safety of glyphosate is carried out by scientists that directly get money from industry," said Vito Buonsante, a lawyer for the group ClientEarth. "This study cannot in any way be reliably considered when deciding whether to approve glyphosate" (Arthur Neslen, London Guardian, May 17). -- SP

Kacee Deener, MPH
Senior Science Advisor
Office of Research and Development
(ph) 202.564.1990 | (mobile) 202.510.1490
deener.kathleen@epa.gov

From: Cogliano, Vincent

Sent: Wednesday, May 18, 2016 9:11 AM

To: Deener, Kathleen <Deener.Kathleen@epa.gov>

Cc: Burke, Thomas <Burke.Thomas@epa.gov>; Kavlock, Robert <Kavlock.Robert@epa.gov>; Hauchman, Fred <hauchman.fred@epa.gov>; Bahadori, Tina <Bahadori.Tina@epa.gov>; Gwinn, Maureen <gwinn.maureen@epa.gov>; Corona, Elizabeth <Corona.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Blackburn, Elizabeth <Blackburn.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Vandenberg, John <Vandenberg.John@epa.gov>; Flowers, Lynn <Flowers.Lynn@epa.gov>; Fegley, Robert <Fegley.Robert@epa.gov>; Perovich, Gina <Perovich.Gina@epa.gov>; Jones, Samantha <Jones.Samantha@epa.gov>

Subject: Re: UN Agencies: Glyphosate 'Unlikely' to Cause Cancer (BNA Report)

Thank you, Kacee. Did you also see the story about Monsanto's large gifts to ILSI, where the reporter noted that a VP of ILSI is Alan Boobis, who chaired EFSA's glyphosate panel?

On May 18, 2016, at 08:51, Deener, Kathleen <Deener.Kathleen@epa.gov> wrote:

UN Agencies: Glyphosate 'Unlikely' to Cause Cancer

By Bryce Baschuk

May 16 — A pair of United Nations agencies said the widely used herbicide glyphosate and two insecticides—diazinon and malathion—are unlikely to pose carcinogenic risk to human beings when exposed to the body in dietary form.

The UN Food and Agriculture Organization (FAO) and the World Health Organization (WHO) issued their findings May 16 in a [joint report](#) following a weeklong meeting in Geneva.

The findings are noteworthy as they run counter to a 2015 report by WHO's International Agency for Research on Cancer (IARC) that classified glyphosate, diazinon and malathion as “probably carcinogenic to humans.”

The FAO and WHO conclusions were based upon an analysis of a “large number” of genotoxicity studies conducted during the past five years that measured the chemicals' effects on living mammals—primarily mice and rats, but also humans.

The joint report noted that it evaluated several new studies that were not considered in the 2015 IARC report.

“In view of the absence of carcinogenic potential in rodents at human-relevant doses and the absence of genotoxicity by the oral route in mammals, and considering the epidemiological evidence from occupational exposures, the Meeting concluded that glyphosate is unlikely to pose a carcinogenic risk to humans from exposure through the diet,” said the report.

Glyphosate

Though the joint report noted that there is “some evidence” of a positive association between glyphosate exposure and a risk for non-Hodgkin lymphoma, it said the only study of “high quality” found no evidence of an association at any exposure level.

Glyphosate—originally developed by Monsanto International SARL under the brand name Roundup—is the world's top herbicide by volume and is used in more than 750 products related to agriculture, forestry, urban and residential landscaping.

The report was released just days before the European Commission's committee that handles pesticides was scheduled to weigh in on re-licensing glyphosate in the 28-nation EU.

“We welcome this rigorous assessment of glyphosate by another program of the WHO, which is further evidence that this important herbicide does not cause cancer,” said Phil Miller, Monsanto's vice president for global regulatory and government affairs. “IARC's classification was inappropriate and inconsistent with the science on glyphosate. Based on the overwhelming weight of evidence, the [FAO/WHO report] has reaffirmed the findings of regulatory agencies around the world that glyphosate is unlikely to pose a cancer risk.”

Diazinon

The joint report found “no convincing evidence” of a positive association between non-Hodgkin lymphoma and diazinon—which is used in agriculture and in home pest control.

The FAO/WHO report said an isolated study found “weak evidence” of a positive association between leukemia and lung cancer to diazinon exposure.

A 2001 U.S. Agricultural Health Study (AHS) report previously linked diazinon exposure to an increased risk for leukemia.

Malathion

The joint report said there is “some very weak evidence” of a positive association between non-Hodgkin lymphoma and malathion—which generally is used in agriculture, for mosquito eradication, and in urban and residential landscaping.

The report noted that the only large cohort study of high quality found no evidence of such an association at any exposure level.

The FAO/WHO report noted that one study found a possible positive association between occupational exposure to malathion and risk of aggressive prostate cancer.

The U.S. Agricultural Health Study previously found an increased risk of lung cancer for humans exposed to malathion.

In a statement, CropLife International CEO Howard Minigh commended the report, which he said “confirms prior conclusions of regulators around the world.”

“It is important to note that the International Agency for Research on Cancer is not a regulator, and uses a narrow set of data to assess potential for hazard; whereas, regulators assess the real risk of a product,” he wrote.

To contact the reporter on this story: Bryce Baschuk in Geneva at correspondents@bna.com

To contact the editor responsible for this story: Greg Henderson at ghenderson@bna.com

Kacee Deener, MPH
Senior Science Advisor
Office of Research and Development
(ph) 202.564.1990 | (mobile) 202.510.1490
deener.kathleen@epa.gov